	Case 3:05-cv-01502-SC	Document 43	-1 Filed 04/06/2006	Page 1 of 29
1	WILLIAM BLUMENTHAL			
2	General Counsel			
3	QUISAIRA A. WHITNEY RICHARD McKEWEN Endered Trade Commission			
4	Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, H Washington DC 20580	H-238		
5	600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, H Washington, DC 20580 (202) 326-2351; 3071/ (202) 326- qwhitney@ftc.gov; rmckewen@ft <i>Counsel for Plaintiff Federal Trac</i>	-3395 (fax)		
6	Counsel for Plaintiff Federal Trac	de Commission		
7	BILL L			
8				
9				
10				
11				
12 13				
13 14				
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22				
23				
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				

Case 3:05-cv-01502-SC

Ι

CONSENT

1	CONSERT						
2	The parties, individually and by and through their counsel and authorized representatives?						
3	signatures below, hereby consent to the entry of the Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction						
4	attached hereto as Exhibit 1.						
5							
6							
7							
8	Quisaira A. WhitneyDateRichard McKewen	Peonie Pui Ting Chen Date					
9	Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, H-238						
10	Washington, DC 20580 Phone: (202) 326-2351 (Whitney)	Qing Kuang (Rick) Yang Date					
11	(202) 326-3071 (McKewen) Fax: (202) 326-3395						
12	Email: qwhitney@ftc.gov rmckewen@ftc.gov						
13	COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION	For: Optin Global, Inc. Date					
14	I KADE COMINISSION						
15		For: Vision Media Limited Corp. Date					
16							
17	/s/ April 6, 2006 Ian K. Sweedler (169969) Date	John Chu (104302) Date					
18 19	Deputy Attorney General Office of the Attorney General	Corporate Counsel Law Group, LLP 505 Sansome Street, Suite 475					
19 20	455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000 San Francisco, CA 94102	San Francisco, CA 94111 Phone: (415) 989-5300					
20	Phone: (415) 703-5597 Fax: (415) 703-5480	Fax: (415) 788-4315 Email: jchu149@yahoo.com					
21	Email: ian.sweedler@doj.ca.gov	CORP., RICK YANG, and PEONIE PUI					
23	COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFF THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA						
24		TING CHEN					
25							
26							
27							
28							
	Stipulation for Entry of Final Judgment and Dermonort Injunction Page 4 of A						

I

	Case 3:05-cv-01502-SC Document 43-1 Filed 04/06/2006 Page 5 of 29	
1	CONSENT	
2	The parties, individually and by and through their counsel and authorized representatives'	-
E		
i		ź
1		
<u> </u>	(# 1	
1		
<u></u>		
		L
<u>.</u>		
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
·		
▲		
	<u> </u>	
·		
		j
r. <u>.</u>		,



EXHIBIT 1

(2004); and Sections 17203, 17204, 17206, 17529.5, 17535, and 17536 of the California
 Business and Professions Code, Cal. Bus. & Prof. Code §§ 17203, 17204, 17206, 17529.5,
 17535, and 17536 (West 1997 & Supp. 2004).

5. Defendants have stipulated to the entry of this Judgment freely and without coercion.Defendants acknowledge that they have read and understand the provisions of this Judgment and are prepared to abide by them.

6. All of the parties to this action have agreed that the entry of this Judgment resolves all matters of dispute among them arising from the Complaint in this action, up to the date of entry of this Judgment.

7. Defendants have waived all rights to seek appellate review or otherwise challenge or
contest the validity of this Judgment. Defendants have further waived and released any claims
they may have against the Commission, the State of California, their employees, representatives,
or agents.

8. Defendants are not entitled to seek or to obtain attorneys' fees as prevailing parties
under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412 (as amended by Pub. L. 104-121, 110
Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996)), and Defendants have waived any right to attorneys' fees that may arise
under said law or any other provision of state or federal law.

9. This Judgment is in addition to, and not in lieu of, any other civil or criminal remedies that may be provided by law.

10. Except as provided herein, no provision of this Judgment shall be construed as an admission that Defendants have engaged in violations of the FTC Act, the CAN-SPAM Act, or the California Business and Professions Code.

11. Entry of this Judgment is in the public interest, and there being no just reason for delay, the Clerk is directed to enter judgment immediately.

DEFINITIONS

1. "Affiliate Program" means any arrangement whereby any person through hyperlinks on the World Wide Web, hyperlinks in commercial email messages, or any other Internet-based

electronic mail address, and any other information that appears in the line identifying, or purporting to identify, a person initiating the message." 15 U.S.C. § 7702(8) (2004).

14. "Hyperlink" means a string of text, an image, or a region of an image that will automatically direct a user to an Internet website when the user selects it with a mouse-click.

15. "Initiate" "when used with respect to a commercial email message, means to originate or transmit such message or to procure the origination or transmission of such message." 15 U.S.C. § 7702(9) (2004).

16. "Plaintiffs" mean the Federal Trade Commission and the People of the State of California.

17. "Procure" "when used with respect to the initiation of a commercial email message, means intentionally to pay or provide other consideration to, or induce, another person to initiate such a message on one's behalf." 15 U.S.C. § 7702(12) (2004).

18. "Protected computer" means a computer that is used in interstate or foreign commerce or communication, including a computer located outside the United States that is used in a manner that affects interstate or foreign commerce or communication of the United States. 15 U.S.C. § 7702(13) (2004); 18 U.S.C. § 1030(e)(2)(B) (2004).

19. "Sender" "when used with respect to a commercial electronic mail message, means a person who initiates such a message and whose product, service, or Internet website is advertised or promoted by the message." 15 U.S.C. § 7702(16)(B) (2004).

20. "Valid physical postal address" means a sender's current street address within the United States, a Post Office box a sender has registered with the United States Postal Service, or a private mailbox a sender has registered with a commercial mail receiving agency that is established pursuant to United States Postal Service regulations; provided, however, that if and when the Commission, pursuant to the CAN-SPAM Act, promulgates any regulation that defines "valid physical postal address," the definition contained in that regulation shall be the definition of "valid physical postal address" for purposes of this Judgment.

//

//

Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction

ORDER

I.

PROHIBITIONS AGAINST VIOLATING CAN-SPAM ACT

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Defendants and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Judgment by personal service or otherwise, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from violating the CAN-SPAM Act by, among other things, initiating a commercial email that:

- A. Contains, or is accompanied by, materially false or materially misleading header information, including but not limited to:
 - an originating electronic mail address, domain name, or Internet Protocol address the access to which, for purposes of originating the message, was obtained by means of false or fraudulent pretenses or representations; or
 - 2. a "from" line (the line identifying or purporting to identify the person initiating the messages) that does not accurately identify any person who initiated the message;
- B. Contains a subject heading likely to mislead recipients, acting reasonably under the circumstances, about material facts regarding the contents or subject matter of the message, including a message subject heading that falsely suggests that the recipient has already submitted a mortgage application, made some inquiry, has an account, or that otherwise suggests that the sender, or any person or entity already has a relationship with the recipient;
- C. Does not: (1) include a clear and conspicuous notice of the recipient's opportunity to decline to receive further commercial electronic mail messages from the sender at the recipient's electronic mail address; and (2) begin with the language "To stop receiving commercial email from us . . . ," and followed by a description of the means by which the recipient can decline to receive future commercial email messages from the sender;

Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction D. Does not include a functioning return electronic mail address or other Internet-based mechanism, clearly and conspicuously displayed, that a recipient can use to submit a reply electronic mail message or other form of Internet-based communication requesting not to receive future commercial electronic mail messages from the sender at the electronic mail address where the message was received, and that remains capable of receiving such messages or communications for no less than 30 days after the transmission of the original message;

- E. Does not include the sender's valid physical postal address;
- F. Is sent to a recipient's email address more than 10 business days (or such lesser time established by future Commission rule) after the sender receives a request from that email recipient not to receive future commercial electronic mail messages from the sender at the recipient's electronic mail address; and
- G. Fails to provide clear and conspicuous identification that the message is an advertisement or solicitation. This prohibition, however, does not apply to commercial email messages transmitted only to recipients from whom Defendants have obtained Affirmative Consent.

II.

RROHHBKILONS AS A TASIFINJOLIA THA GOSE C(FICINE 172.9478536 reose pd(to 98ns) Tj3.s9

B. The commercial email message has a subject line that a person knows would be likely to mislead a recipient, acting reasonably under the circumstances, about a material fact regarding the contents or subject matter of the message.

III.

MONITORING OF AFFILIATES BY DEFENDANTS FOR COMPLIANCE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants and their officers, agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Judgment by personal service or otherwise, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from initiating a commercial email or operating any affiliate program without taking the following steps to ensure compliance with Parts I and II of this Judgment:

 A. Prior to any person's participation in an affiliate program operated by Defendants, Defendants shall require each prospective participant to provide identifying information to Defendants, including, but not limited to:

the name, physical address, and a working telephone number for each prospective participant. In the event that the prospective participant is not a natural person, but is a corporation, partnership, proprietorship, limited liability company, or other organization or legal entity, including an association, cooperative, agency, or other group or combination acting as an entity, Defendants shall also require from that prospective participant the name(s), address(es), and working telephone number(s) of the natural person(s) who owns, manages, or controls that prospective participant;

 if the natural person(s) listed in Paragraph A.1 of this Part resides in the United States, a photocopy of that person's driver's license or other State-issued identification card; and

3. if the natural person(s) listed in Paragraph A.1 of this Part resides outside of the United States, a photocopy of a government-issued identification for such person;

B. Defendant shall require each person who participates in any of Defendants' affiliate

1

2

Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction programs to provide identifying information to Defendants concerning that participant's sub-affiliates, employees, agents, or sub-contractors who initiate commercial email messages on Defendants' behalf. Such identifying information shall include the same types of information as required by Paragraph A of this Part and shall be required prior to that person's participation in any of Defendants' affiliate programs or immediately after any change to that participant's sub-affiliates, employees, agents, or sub-contractors;

- C. Prior to any person's participation in any of Defendants' affiliate programs, Defendants shall provide each such person with a copy of this Judgment;
- D. Prior to any person's participation in any of Defendants' affiliate programs,
 Defendants shall obtain from each such person an express written agreement to
 comply with this Judgment, the CAN-SPAM Act, and Section 17529.5 of the
 California Business and Professions Code, as well as an acknowledgment of receipt
 of a copy of this Judgment;
- E. Defendants shall require each person who initiates commercial email messages onDefendants' behalf to submit to Defendants, at least seven (7) days prior to the start of an email campaign on Defendants' behalf, the following information:
 - 1. the subject line, body, and source code for each email message in the proposed email campaign;
 - 2. the email address(es) from which each proposed campaign will be sent; and
 - 3. the proposed dates that the email messages in the campaign will be sent;
- F. At least three (3) days prior to the start of an email campaign that has been submitted to Defendants under Paragraph E of this Part, Defendants shall review that email campaign for compliance with the CAN-SPAM Act, Section 17529.5 of the California Business and Professions Code, and this Judgment. If, after reviewing such email campaign, Defendants determine that the campaign is in compliance with the CAN-SPAM Act, Section 17529.5 of the California Business and Professions Code, and this Judgment, Defendants shall provide to the person who submitted that

Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction

been directed to Defendants' web site by a commercial email message. I

nonrecourse promissory note in the amount of five hundred thousand dollars
(\$500,000) payable to Plaintiffs and secured by a mortgage on the real property
located at 3 Grant Street, Adams, Massachusetts, (the "Adams Property"), said
note due and payable one hundred eighty (180) days after entry of this Judgment.
5. Defendant Chen shall cooperate fully with Plaintiffs and be responsible for
preparing, executing and recording the necessary documents and doing whatever
else Plaintiffs deem reasonably necessary or desirable to perfect, evidence, and
effectuate its liens and security interests granted against the Las Vegas and Adams
Properties. Defendant Chen shall be responsible for paying all fees and costs
required in connection with the liens granted herein, including all fees (including attorneys' fees, if any) and costs related to the preparation, execution, deliverdnul 0 Interest I attorneys' fees, if any) and costs related to the preparation.

immediately become due and payable, and in that event, Plaintiffs are hereby authorized to execute judgment for such amount against Defendants;

D. Plaintiffs' agreement to this Judgment is expressly premised upon the truthfulness, accuracy, and completeness of Defendants' sworn financial statements and supporting documents, as well as the sworn deposition testimony given by Defendants on August 17-18, 2005, all of which include material information upon which Plaintiffs have relied in negotiating and agreeing to this Judgment. If, upon motion by Plaintiffs, this Court finds that Defendants have failed to disclose any material asset or materially misstated the value of any asset in the financial statements, related documents, or testimony described above, or have made any other material misstatement or omission in the finlk34:Dalkatbalkstates.

IV.B.1 and IV.B.2 of this Judgment. The asset freeze on the Las Vegas Property and the Adams
 Property shall also be lifted to the extent necessary to sell those properties and transfer the
 proceeds of each sale as required by Paragraph IV.B.6 of this Judgment. The asset freeze on
 Defendant Chen's property located at 6466 Livia Avenue, Temple City, California, shall be lifted
 upon the transfer to the California Department of Justice of the funds described in Paragraphs
 IV.B.1 and IV.B.2 of this Judgment.

VI.

COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating The

Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act,
 15 U.S.C. §§ 49 and 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or
 information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the
 Cvant to u 0 0 -1 63.7200012 778.44000 931, to obtain a 45(a)mair or 1
 6

managers. Defendants must also deliver copies of this Judgment to all of their employees, agents, independent contractors, and persons who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of this Judgment. For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Judgment. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities; and

B. Defendants must secure a signed and dated written or electronic statement (which signature may be obtained electronically provided that the signature would comply with the signature requirements of the Electronic Signatures in Global and National Commerce Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 7001 *et seq.*), acknowledging receipt of this Judgment, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of this Judgment pursuant to this Part.

X.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that each Defendant, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Judgment as entered by the Court, must submit to Plaintiffs a truthful sworn statement acknowledging having received and read this Judgment.

XI.

FEES AND COSTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, except as provided in Paragraph IV.B.1, each party to this Judgment shall bear his, her, or its own costs and attorneys' fees incurred in connection with this action.

XII.

DUTY TO COOPERATE

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants shall cooperate fully, truthfully and completely with Plaintiffs in any litigation related to this matter. This cooperation includes, but is not limited to, maintaining all documents relevant to the litigation and assisting in the

Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction

	Case 3:05-cv-01502-SC	Document 43-1	Filed 04/06/2006	Page 29 of 29
				18
1				
2				1
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18				
19				
20				
21				
22 23				
23 24				
25				
26				
27				
28				