

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES S

In the Matter of

THE NORTH CAROLINA [STATE] BOARD OF DENTAL EXAMINERS, PUBLIC

DOCKET NO. 9343

Respondent.

RESPONDENT'S MOTION TO STRIKE (IN PART) REBUTTAL REPORT OF PROFESSOR JOHN KWOKA

NOW COMES Respondent, by and through the undersigned attorneys, pursuant to Rule 3.31A(a) of the FTC Rules of Practice for Adjudicative Proceedings, and respectfully moves the Administrative Law Judge for an Order striking (in part) the Rebuttal Report of Professor John Kwoka in the above-captioned matter. In support of this motion, Respondent shows the following:

)

)

1. The Expert Witness Report of Professor John Kwoka was provided to Respondent by Complaint Counsel on November 26, 2010.

2. Respondent provided the Expert Witness Report of Dr. David Baumer to

Complaint Counsel on December 20, 2010.

3. Professor Kwoka's Rebuttal Report was provided to Respondent on January 8, 2011.

4. Respondent moves to strike the following matters and information presented in Professor Kwoka's Rebuttal Report, all of which do not rebut matters set forth in Dr. Baumer's Expert Report:

1

€ page 1 – all paragraphs under heading I

€ page 2 – paragraphs 1 – 3 under heading II

€ page 3 – paragraph 2

€ page 5 – paragraphs 1 and 2 under heading III

€ page 7 – last sentence of paragraph 4

€ page 8 – first paragraph

5. Counsel for Respondent has conferred with Complaint Counsel about this Motion to Strike (in part), and Complaint Counsel have indicated that they will oppose this motion.

WHEREFORE, Respondent respectfully requests that the Administrative Law Judge:

1. Strike (in part) the expert witness rebuttal report of Professor John Kwoka

as requested above; and

2. For such other and further relief as deemed just and proper.

This the 13th day of January, 2011.

ALLEN AND PINNIX, P.A.

/s/ Alfred P. Carlton, Jr.

NoelL. Allen Alfred P. Carton, Jr. M.JacksorNichols Attorneys for Respondent Post Office Drawer 1270 Raleigh, North Carolina 27602 Telephone: 919-755-0505 Facsimile: 919-829-8098 Email:acarlton@allen-pinnix.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 13, 2011, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Federal Trade Commission using the FTC E-file system, which will send notification of such filing to the following:

Donald S. Clark, Secretary Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room H-159 Washington, D.C. 20580

I hereby certify that the undersigned has this date served copies of the foregoing upon all parties to this cause by electronic mail as follows:

William L. Lanning Bureau of Competition Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room NJ-6264 Washington, D.C. 20580 wlanning@ftc.gov

Melissa Westman-Cherry Bureau of Competition Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room NJ-6264 Washington, D.C. 20580 westman@ftc.gov

Michael J. Bloom Bureau of Competition Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room H-374 Washington, D.C. 20580 <u>mjbloom@ftc.go</u>v Steven L. Osnowitz Bureau of Competition Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room NJ-6264 Washington, D.C. 20580 sosnowitz@ftc.gov

Tejasvi Srimushnam Bureau of Competition Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room NJ-6264 Washington, D.C. 20580 tsrimushnam@ftc.gov

Richard B. Dagen Bureau of Competition Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Room H-374 Washington, D.C. 20580 rdagen@ftc.gov I also certify that I have sent courtesy copies of the document via Federal Express and electronic mail to:

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell Administrative Law Judge Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue N.W. Room H-113 Washington, D.C. 20580 oalj@ftc.gov

This the 13th day of January, 2011.

<u>/s/ Alfred P. Carlton, Jr.</u> Alfred P. Carlton, Jr.

CERTIFICATION FOR ELECTRONIC FILING

I further certify that the electronic copy sent to the Secretary of the Commission is a true and correct copy of the paper original and that I possess a paper original of the signed document that is available for review by the parties and by the adjudicator.

> <u>/s/ Alfred P. Carlton, Jr.</u> Alfred P. Carlton, Jr.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES

In the Matter of

THE NORTH CAROLINA [STATE] BOARD OF DENTAL EXAMINERS, PUBLIC

DOCKET NO. 9343

Respondent.

[PROPOSED] ORDER ON RESPONDENT'S MOTION TO STRIKE (IN PART) REBUTTAL REPORT OF PROFESSOR JOHN KWOKA

This matter comes before the undersigned on Respondent's Motion to Strike (in

)

Part) Expert Witness Rebuttal Report of Professor John Kwoka. Having considered the

motion, it is hereby

ORDERED, that Respondent's Motion to Strike (in Part) the Expert Witness

Rebuttal Report of Professor John Kwoka is Granted. The matters in Professor Kwoka's

Rebuttal	Report	that	shall	be	struck	are	as
follows:							

ORDERED:

D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge

Date: January ____, 2011