





' < / " 9 0 ) \$ , % , % 7 " 5 9 , - , > . 0 " F F

F F / , ) \* + @ " ) , / 5 6 \$ 9 \$ 5 - 0 9 , G 0 / " 8 9 : " ; ( 9 ) \$ % % < / " ) 0 - 6 ( & ( + ( 7 @ : " " 8 9 : "

; ( 9 ) \$ % % < / " - 0 / - / " 5 ( % - 9 ( + 0 & " ? ( 9 " 0 = ( 7 0 % ( . / " ? \$ 5 - ( 9 / " B 6 0 " - 6 0 9 0 " B \$ / " \$ " % 0 0 & " - ( " 5 ( % - 9 ( + " ? ( 9 " - 6 0 ) : "

X 6 0 " - 6 0 9 0 " B \$ / " % ( - " \$ " % 0 0 & " - ( " 5 ( % - 9 ( + " ? ( 9 " 0 = ( 7 0 % ( . / " ? \$ 5 - ( 9 / " 6 0 " & , & " % ( - : " J ( 9 " 0 = \$ ) \* + 0 " - ( " - 0 / - " - 6 0 "

6 @ \* ( - 6 0 / 0 " / 0 - " ( . - , % " - 6 0 " ' ( ) \* + \$ , % - " 1 c c " O N F O P 4 " - 6 \$ - " - 6 0 " d \$ % . \$ 9 @ " \$ % & " d . % 0 " N R R M " ) . + , \* + , 0 9 / " B 0 9 0 "

2 . \$ + - % " + \* - \$ % # ' 3 " - 6 \$ - " B 0 9 0 " 2 - 6 0 " 9 0 / . + - " ( ? " \$ 5 ( ) C , % \$ - , ( % " \$ % & " 5 ( % / \* , 9 \$ 5 @ 3 " C @ " B 6 , 5 6 " Y - \$ 9 " \$ % & "

Y , 7 ) \$ " 2 : + 6 + / C ( D " / 0 % + \$ " ( + ' - ) 9 \* / + \* 5 " > \$ ) 6 " . 9 & : + - " . \$ + - % " : % , % : " ' " , % " ( 9 & 0 9 " - ( " , % & . 5 0 " W 5 X \$ % 0 " - ( "

/ . \* \* ( 9 - " 0 + 5 0 % \$ " . \$ + - % " : % , % : ' A 3 " 8 9 : " ; ( 9 ) \$ % % / - . & , 0 & " - 6 0 " d \$ % . \$ 9 @ " \$ % & " d . % 0 " N R R M " ) . + , \* + , 0 9 / " \$ % & " - 6 0 "

, % H ( , 5 0 " & \$ - \$ " 1 B 6 , 5 6 " 9 0 ? + 0 5 - / " & , / 5 ( . % - / " C 0 + ( B " - 6 0 " ) . + , \* + , 0 9 " & , / 5 ( . % - / 4 " F F " - 6 0 " H 0 9 @ " \* 9 , 5 0 " & 0 5 , / , ( % / "

\$ + 0 7 0 & + @ " \$ - , / / . 0 " F F " \$ % & " ? ( . % & " 0 H , & 0 5 0 " - 6 \$ - " 5 ( % 5 + . / , H 0 + @ " & , / \* 9 ( H 0 & " - 6 0 " 6 @ \* ( - 6 0 / 0 " ( % " - , - / " ? \$ 5 0 "

1 B , - 6 ( . - " \$ % @ " % 0 0 & " - ( " 5 ( % - 9 ( + " ? ( 9 " ( . - / , & 0 " ? \$ 5 - ( 9 / 4 ^ " [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

8 9 : " ; ( 9 ) \$ % % < / " ( \* , % , ( % / " \$ % & " \* 9 , 5 0 " \$ \$ + @ / 0 " 9 0 \$ & , + @ " / \$ - , / ? @ " - 6 0 " J 0 & : " a : " ] H , & : " L R N " \$ % & "

Daubert " 9 0 > . , 9 0 ) 0 % - / : " \_ 0 " , / " , % & , / \* . - \$ C + @ " > . \$ + , ? , 0 & A " \$ % & " 5 \$ 9 0 ? . + @ " \$ % & " - 6 ( . 7 6 - ? . + @ " \$ \* \* + , 0 & " \$ "

9 0 + , \$ C + 0 " ) 0 - 6 ( & ( + ( 7 @ " - ( " 9 0 + , \$ C + 0 " & \$ - \$ - 6 \$ - " B \$ / " . / 0 & " C @ " - 6 0 " \* \$ 9 - , 0 / " , % " - 6 0 " ( 9 & , % \$ 9 @ " 5 ( . 9 / 0 " ( ? "

[REDACTED]

<sup>N</sup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

9. % %, % 7 "-60, 9" C. / , % 0 / / 0 " ( H 0 9 "-60 "+ \$ / - "& 0 5 \$ & 0 : " ' ' < / " \$ / / 0 9 - , ( % / " - ( "-60" 5 ( % - 9 \$ 9 @ A " C \$ / 0 & " 0 % - , 9 0 + @ " ( % " , - / " ( B % " 0 = \* 0 9 - < / " \$ ? - 0 9 F - 6 0 F ? \$ 5 - A " ) , % ( 9 " 5 9 , - , > . 0 A " \$ 9 0 " \* . 9 0 " ? , 5 - , ( % : 0 "

0 . ( \* \$ . & "% . ( K 7 2 / \$ ) , "

' 0 " , ? 0 " ) @ ? H > : : " \$ J = I " 2 = G F > S G = " , > ; > "

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

" 5 ( % - \$ , % 0 & " \$ % @ " \$ % ( ) \$ + , 0 / : " " 8 9 : " ; ( 9 ) \$ % % " \$ % & " 6 , / " - \$ ? ? " 5 ( % & . 5 - 0 & "

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

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

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

<sup>0</sup> " " \$ % & 0 0 & A " ' ' " & , & % ( - " \$ ? ? , 9 ) \$ - , H 0 + @ " 9 0 \$ 5 6 ( . - " - ( " 5 ( . % / 0 + ? ( 9 " W 5 X \$ % 0 " - ( " 5 ( % & . 5 - " ) 0 0 - " \$ % & " 5 ( % ? 0 9 " 9 0 7 \$ 9 & , % 7 " 8 9 : " ; ( 9 ) \$ % % < / " \* 9 , 5 0 " \$ % \$ + @ / 0 / A " \$ % & " ( % + @ " 9 \$ , / 0 & " - 6 0 , / / . 0 " \$ / " \$ - , - F ? ( 9 F - \$ - " B 6 0 " W 5 X \$ % 0 " 5 \$ + 0 & " - ( " 5 ( % ? 0 9 " ( % , - / " ) ( - , ( % " - ( 0 = 5 + . & 0 " 8 9 : " Y 5 6 . ) \$ % % : "

-6,/"+(B"% . ) C09"(?"\* (-0%-,\$++@"/ ./\*05-"-9\$%/\$5-,(%/"\$%&"?( .%&"-6\$"-60"\$5- . \$+"-9\$%/\$5-,(%"\*9,50/"  
B090"/( . %&:"

X,-6"90/\*05-("-60"\*9,5,%7"&\$-\$1. /0&,"%J,7.90/"NTA"NUA"OFPA"QF#RA"NOFNPA"NMFO#A"\$%&"  
(\*,%,(%/"C\$/0&"(%"-60) 4"-6\$-" ' ' "56\$9\$5-09,G0/"\$/"5(%-\$,%,%7" -60"H\$/-"  
) \$I(9,-@"(?"-60"-9\$%/\$5-,(%"/- . &,0&"\$90"\$--9,C. -\$C+0"-("&\$-\$"-6\$"-B\$/"(CI05-,HO+@"% (-"\*9(C+0) ) \$-,5:"  
J(9"0\$56"(?"-60/0"? ,7.90/A"C0-B00%"FFG"##("HIIG")>"/0%",):96%5\$%"C0"\$--9,C. -0&"-(" . %&,\* . -0&"  
-9\$%/\$5-,(%/h"\$%&"0H0%"potentially \*9(C+0) ) \$-,5"-9\$%/\$5-,(%/"\$90"+, ) , -0&"-("\$"/ ) \$+"% . ) C09"(?"  
-9\$%/\$5-,(%/" ,%"W5 X\$%0</"\*9,50"/09,0/"(%+@"1Y-\$9"\$%&"Y,7) \$</"&\$-\$"B090"% ("??05-0&4A"-6. /"  
) \$ \ ,%7"any \$%( ) \$+,0/" , ) ) \$-09,\$+:"

[Redacted]

[Redacted] V6,/"+(B"% . ) C09"(?"0H0%"potentially ".+1. "(?

[Redacted]

\_\_\_\_\_

# \$ % & ' (

T / " 0 = \* + \$ , % 0 & " , % " ? . 9 - 6 0 9 " & 0 - \$ , + , % " 6 , / " & 0 5 + \$ 9 \$ - , ( % A " , - " B \$ / " % ( - " % 0 5 0 / / \$ 9 @

. 2 7 \$ 1 + ) \*

D. 9/ . \$ % - ( " J 0 & 0 9 \$ + " a . + 0 " ( ? " ] H , & 0 % 5 0 " L R N " \$ % & " 9 0 + 0 H \$ % - " 5 \$ / 0 " + \$ B A " \$ " 5 ( . 9 - " / 6 ( . + & " C 0 " \$ C + 0 " - ( " ( C - \$ , % " - 6 0 " C 0 % 0 ? , - ( ? " \$ % " 0 = \* 0 9 - < / " ( \* , % , ( % " / ( " + ( % 7 " \$ / " 1 # 4 " - 6 0 " 0 = \* 0 9 - " , / " > . \$ + , ? , 0 & h " 1 N 4 " - 6 0 " 0 = \* 0 9 - < / " ( \* , % , ( % " , / " C \$ / 0 & " ( % " 9 0 + , \$ C + 0 " ) 0 - 6 ( & / " \$ % & " \* 9 , % 5 , \* + 0 / h " \$ % & " 1 0 4 " - 6 0 " 0 = \* 0 9 - < / " ) 0 - 6 ( & / " ? , - " - 6 0 " ? \$ 5 - / " ( ? " - 6 0 " 5 \$ / 0 : " *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharms., Inc.* A " E R Q " [ : Y : " E L Q A " E L Q F M R " 1 # Q Q 0 4 : " 8 9 : " ; ( 9 ) \$ % % " 0 \$ / , + @ " ) 0 0 - / " - 6 0 " / - \$ % & \$ 9 & / " ( ? " a . + 0 " L R N " \$ % & " *Daubert* : " \_ 0 " , / " , % & , / \* . - \$ C + @ " > . \$ + , ? , 0 & " C @ " 0 & . 5 \$ - , ( % A " - 9 \$ , % , % 7 A " \$ % & " 0 = \* 0 9 , 0 % 5 0 " - ( " - 0 / - , ? @ " \$ / " \$ % " 0 = \* 0 9 - " , % " - 6 , / " ) \$ - 0 9 A " \$ % & " > . , C C + 0 / " ( H 0 9 " 6 , / " \$ / / . ) \* - , ( % / " 9 0 7 \$ 9 & , % 7 " \$ / ) \$ + " ? 9 \$ 5 - , ( % " ( ? " \$ % ( ) \$ + ( . / " & \$ - \$ " 0 % - 9 , 0 / " , % " \$ " H 0 9 @ " + \$ 9 7 0 " \$ ) ( . % - " ( ? " & \$ - \$ , / " % ( - " \$ " \* 9 ( \* 0 9 " 9 0 \$ / ( % " - ( " 0 = 5 + . & 0 " 6 , / " 0 = \* 0 9 - " ( \* , % , ( % : " " *Fisher v. Ciba Specialty Chemicals Corp.* A " N R R L " X j " N O R N P L R " \$ - " k # E " ? % : 0 # " 1 Y : 8 : " T + \$ : " N R R L 4 " 1 2 V ( " - 6 0 " 0 = 0 % - " - 6 \$ - " e \* \$ 9 - , 0 / f % ( B " > . , C C + 0 " B , - 6 " - 6 0 " \$ 5 5 . 9 \$ 5 @ " ( ? " - 6 0 " + , H , % 7 " 6 , / - ( 9 @ " & \$ - \$ " : " : " - 6 0 " 9 0 ) 0 & @ " , / " % ( - " - ( " - 6 9 ( B " ( . - " e 0 = \* 0 9 - f " - 0 / - , ) ( % @ " , % , - / " 0 % - , 9 0 - @ " \$ / " . % 9 0 + , \$ C + 0 " . % & 0 9 " *Daubert* 3 4 h " *Cook v. Rockwell Intern. Corp.* A " E M R " J : Y . \* \* : N & " # R L # A " # R Q N " 1 8 : " ' ( + ( : " N R R K 4 " 1 & , / \* . - 0 / " ( H 0 9 " - 6 0 " 9 0 + , \$ C , + , - @ " ( ? " & \$ - \$ " / 0 - " B \$ / " 2 \$ " 5 + \$ / / , 5 " & , / \$ 7 9 0 0 ) 0 % - " C 0 - B 0 0 % " 0 = \* 0 9 - / " - 6 \$ - " 7 ( 0 / " - ( " - 6 0 " 5 9 0 & , C , + , - @

# \$ % & ' (

\$ % & " ( ? - 0 % " + ( B 0 9 " - 6 \$ % " Y , 7 ) \$ < / " \$ % & " Y - \$ 9 < / h " 1 N 4 " W 5 X \$ % 0 < / " , % H ( , 5 0 F + 0 H 0 + " I ( C " & , / 5 ( . % - / " 5 ( % - , % . 0 & " , % "



8 \$ - 0 & ^ " T . 7 . / - " # O A " N R # N "

n / n " d : " T + \$ % " V 9 . , - - "

o o n / n " d ( / 0 \* 6 " T : " p / - ( @ , 5 6 o o o o o o "

d : " T + \$ % " V 9 . , - - "  
V 6 ( ) \$ / " X : " V 6 \$ 7 \$ 9 & " S S S "  
*Maynard Cooper and Gale PC*  
# Q R # " Y , = - 6 " T H 0 % . 0 " ; ( 9 - 6 "  
N P R R " a 0 7 , ( % / " \_ \$ 9 C 0 9 - " D + \$ G \$ "  
U , 9 ) , % 7 6 \$ ) A " T j " O E N R O "  
D 6 ( % 0 ^ " N R E : N E P : # R R R "  
J \$ = ^ " N R E : N E P : # Q Q Q "  
\$ - 9 . , - - q ) \$ @ % \$ 9 & 5 ( ( \* 0 9 : 5 ( ) "  
-- 6 \$ 7 \$ 9 & q ) \$ @ % \$ 9 & 5 ( ( \* 0 9 : 5 ( ) "

d ( / 0 \* 6 " T : " p / - ( @ , 5 6 "  
X , + , \$ ) " j \$ H 0 9 @ "  
*Baker Botts L.L.P.*  
V 6 0 " X \$ 9 % 0 9 "  
# N Q Q " D 0 % % / @ + H \$ % , \$ " T H 0 : A " ; : X : "  
X \$ / 6 , % 7 - ( % A " 8 : ' : " N R R R P F N P N R "  
D 6 ( % 0 ^ " N R N : K O Q : L L R R "  
J \$ = ^ " N R N : K O Q : L M Q R "  
I ( / 0 \* 6 : ( / - ( @ , 5 6 q C \$ \ 0 9 C ( - - / : 5 ( ) "  
B , + , \$ ) : + \$ H 0 9 @ q C \$ \ 0 9 C ( - - / : 5 ( ) "

*Attorneys for Respondent McWane, Inc*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on August 13, 2012, I filed the foregoing document electronically using the FTC's E-Filing System, which I send notification of such filing to:

Donald S. Clark  
Secretary  
Federal Trade Commission  
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Rm. H-113  
Washington, DC 20580

I also certify that I delivered via overnight delivery a copy of the foregoing document to:

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell  
Administrative Law Judge  
Federal Trade Commission  
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Rm. H-110  
Washington, DC 20580

I further certify that I delivered via electronic mail a copy of the foregoing document to:

Edward Hassi, Esq.  
Geoffrey M. Green, Esq.  
Linda Holleran, Esq.  
Thomas H. Brock, Esq.  
Michael L. Bloom, Esq.  
Jeanine K. Balbach, Esq.  
J. Alexander Ansaldo, Esq.  
Andrew K. Mann, Esq.

By:           /s/ William C. Lavery            
William C. Lavery  
Counsel for McWane, Inc.







