David Besanko[†] Ulrich Doraszelski Yaroslav Kryukov[§] November 9, 2012



^{*}We thank Lanier Benkard, Luis Cabral, Chiara Fumagalli, Dan Gottlieb, Joe Harrington, Ken Hendricks, Ariel Pakes, Mike Riordan, Mark Satterthwaite, and Connan Snider as well as the Editor and two anonymous referees for helpful discussions and suggestions. We also thank participants at the 2010 Searle Center Conference on Antitrust Economics and Competition Policy, the Ninth Annual International Industrial Organization Conference, and the 2011 NYU Stern IO Day for their useful questions and comments. Besanko and Doraszelski gratefully acknowledge nancial support from the National Science Foundation under Grant

1 Introduction

าะ าธ าะffi

3 F 3 F

13 -**٦** н U 4 F U - 4 F Ч K **٦**► **٦**► rn fi **٦**F **٦**F **٦**F ль fl ль ne ne fi **٦** F ЯΕ **٦**F **٦**K **٦**F 3 F **Ч н**

3.6 3.6 Э.Ε 3.6 3.6 fi fi artí ar าคาเร เ าศีลศาศ **7** K ль ар fi лр **٦** k પા**ર્કા** ગા **1+ 1+** / ff акак ак" ак fi **ч н** ٦F ff the the 3.6 ռանելու են հեռենն ٦.F

27 - 22?

\F \F \F 3 k 7.F. 7.F. **1**F **3**F **1**F ъ ff с л.н. Л.н. чь чь fi чь 3 F 3 F **Ч Р** " лнанлн и **٦**6 **٦**6 **٦** F **1** F **ч**н чн **ЧΕ ЧΕ ٦**F **٦**F

Э.Н **1** F Э.Н ጓዞ ጓሎ ٦н л**н** лн U 1 - 1 - 1 -ЗΕ 3 F **1** F **16 1**F лн лн — лн — лн Э. н

лклк ак лк лк лк

3 F	3.F - U	ан	٦.F"	3.F	ΊР	٦ F
	ЧΕ	3.F. 3.F		1 F		
		3.F. 3.F.	U (1) F	7.F U	٦ F	
1 F	чк fi	Э. н		₹ ₩. ₹₽	٦ F	
٦ F		3.F 3.F		11	5	



2 Model

٦₽ **٦**₽ **٦**₽ **٦**₽

		ኘዞ	7 h	fi	i			٦ н	ባ ሌ	1 F	
			3 K		٦ F	fi	3.6				ገሎ
		٦	•								
	ан		fi	ХН						161F	
٦F											
		0	0		•	0.01			C		
Γ		2	r−2		2	2 6 2	•		'n	n γ	
ኘዞ			n ∎fi			Ч н	n ;			TFTR fi	
	$p_1; p_2$										

٦F

⁷See the Online Appendix for closed-form expressions for $E = X_1 | X_1 \ge X_1(\mathbf{e}')$ in equation (1) and $E_S = S_1 | S_1 \le S_1(\mathbf{e}')$ in equation (2).







⁸Empirical studies show that organizations can forget the know-how gained through learning-by-doing due to labor turnover, periods of inactivity, and failure to institutionalize tacit knowledge (Argote, Beckman & Epple 1990, Darr, Argote & Epple 1995, Benkard 2000, Shafer, Nembhard & Uzumeri 2001, Thompson 2007). Besanko et al. (2010) show that organizational forgetting predisposes rms to price aggressively. Omitting organizational forgetting from the model therefore \stacks the deck" against nding predation-like behavior.

⁹We obviously have to ensure $e_n \leq M$. To simplify the exposition we abstract from boundary issues in what follows.

¹⁰Formally, our learning-by-doing model is a special case of the general model with the probability that the industry's state changes from e to e' during the price-setting phase set to

$$\Pr\left(\mathbf{e}'|\mathbf{e};\mathbf{q}\right) = \begin{array}{ccc} q_1 & \text{if} & \mathbf{e}' = (e_1 + 1; e_2); \\ q_2 & \text{if} & \mathbf{e}' = (e_1; e_2 + 1); \\ 1 - q_1 - q_2 & \text{if} & \mathbf{e}' = \mathbf{e}; \end{array}$$

where q_n is the probability that incumbent rm *n* makes the sale as given in equation (6).

e —	− price–setting phase — → e	exit-entry phase e
duopo	oly: both firms are incumbents	
		both stay in
		1 exits, 2 stays in
	heither wins sale	1 stays in, 2 exits
		both exit
		_both stay in
		1 exits, 2 stays in
$(e_1, e_2 -$		1 stays in, 2 exits
		both exit
		both stay in
	2 wine cale	1 exits, 2 stays in
		1 stays in, 2 exits
		both exit

monopoly: firm 1 is incumbent, firm 2 is entrant



empty: both firms are entrants



٦F

٦F

٦F

$mr_1 p_1; p_2$	$-p_1 - \frac{1}{1 - D_1(p_1; p_2(\mathbf{e}))}$	î k	fi	7 F
	tis to the the t			

E 🔊

	3.6	хн	1 F	fi	
7 F	$1 \infty \infty M/$				



3 Equilibrium and computation

fi 📭 ٦.F 14 **161F ٦** Р а н ٦.F ٦.F эн UR F $-e_1$; e_2 fi fi **٦ н** ЪF ٦F Эн ffi ar ar fi *e*₂;*e*₁ **٦** F **٦** Р U **АН АНАН АН** 8 F 3 F ЪF ЪF ЯF U 3 K.3 F ЯΕ ٦F Э. Р ٦F ٦ ۴ fi 7 K ٦F ЪF **٦**F **٦**F а н ЪF ЧН ЧН / ън *Н х; !* −_ **٦**► **٦**► **٦**►**٦**► ٦F / NE X **3** F $\forall F = X$ **Э.**Е чь *H x; ! →____ !* η. **٦**F **٦**F чк *Н х; ! –*– 31 7 K **٦**Ε **٦**Ε ак акак ак ак — " ак — Х; ! ЪF **٦** Р **3 F 3 F3 F** ٦.F Str fi x s ; ! s **٦**F **٦**F **٦**F H^{-1} ! -- x H x; ! -- ff H x s; ! s --**٦ н**

 $\frac{\mathscr{P}H(x(s);!(s))}{\mathscr{P}_X}X'S = \frac{\mathscr{P}H(x(s);!(s))}{\mathscr{P}_X}I'S = -$ ЧК. ЧР ЧР ъ Н х;! --**٦ F 3 F3 F** 3.6 ак акак ff 3.6 3.6 みと てん てと てと てと **3.F 3.F 3.F** H^{-1} / -x; / H x; / -4 at the transmither H x; / -z the ле леае ч.н 1F 1F 1F 1F **٦** F へんへん **τρ τρ ;ω --**٦Ε 3 F $-\mathbf{V}_1; \ _1; \ _1; \phi_1$ as -1ω --**ЧЕ ЧЕ ЧЕ** ω -- ; ; \overline{X} ;::: 15 if if ;w - 1 nr nr **٦**6 **٦**6 **٦**Ε - **٦**Ε fi ЧF ЯF ٩ĸ $^{-1}$ 1 + 1 + 1 +





assesses its prospects in the industry. In this particular equilibrium, $_2(e_1;0) = 1.00$ for $e_1 \in \{2; :::; 30\}$, so that the potential entrant does not enter if the incumbent rm has moved down from the top of its learning curve.

¹⁹The multiple closed communicating classes that may arise for a particular equilibrium are conceptually di erent from multiple equilibria. A closed communicating class is a set of states from which there is no escape once the industry has entered it. The transient distribution in period 1000 accounts for the probability of reaching any one of these classes, starting from state (1;1) in period 0.

					า				
Т	p_1	p_2	1	2		p_1	p_2	1	2

$$\overline{p} = \frac{\sum_{n=1}^{2} D_{n} p_{1} ; p_{2}}{D_{1} p_{1} ; p_{2} ; q_{2} p_{1} ; p_{2}} p_{n} :$$

7 **2**. E a-ra a rr:

$$CS^{\infty}$$
 – ∞ CS ;

CS TH E n-rn r:

$$TS^{\infty} = \infty$$

e $\end{bmatrix} CS = \frac{1}{n=1}^{2} PS_{n}$;

 $PS_n \qquad \text{ refin} \qquad 20$ $E \qquad \text{ refin} \qquad 20$

$$CS^{NPV} \xrightarrow{\infty}_{T=0}^{\infty} T^{T} T CS$$
 :

r : Eち 13 $TS^{NPV} \xrightarrow{\infty}_{T=0}^{\infty} T T T = \begin{bmatrix} CS & \sqrt{2} \\ N=1 \end{bmatrix} CS = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ N=1 \end{bmatrix} CS$ μ^{∞} CS^{∞} TS^{∞} а н ٦F ЪF **٦ዞ ٦**ዜ **16 86** ан CS^{NPV} TS^{NPV} ٦ F $\mu^0 \mu^1$ Э. Р CS^{NPV} TS^{NPV} **٦ k** ٦F ٢ ۴ fl ٦.F ** B *B ٦F ۴ а н Э.К. fi fl зн ъ ٦.F ٦.F ЪÞ $_{\mathrm{ff}}$

а н

ЪF

ан

Ъ.

²⁰See the Online Appendix for expressions for $CS(\mathbf{e})$ and $PS_n(\mathbf{e})$.

ar CS^∞

 CS^{NPV}

ЯΕ

		A F
HHI∞		
\overline{p}^{∞}		
CS^{∞}		
TS^{∞}		
CS^{NPV}		

3.F - 3.F

	7 F	U	U		7 K
	3.F	лн ан		А.Н	٦ F ٦ F
16 16	3.6		3 F		

4.2 Equilibrium correspondence







٦ F

ſ	🕶 ff	-2-	•		٦	h		ъ HI	HI^{∞}	
	٦	ff	٦ F	fl	٦ Ε			ar fi	i	
٦ F			\rightarrow	N R F	٦ F	٦ F 3 F	ኘዞ	٦ F	ч μ	fi
n fi	U (1) F	ff	٦ F			a	۰	:	٦ F	٦ F
ан			ат	+ 1			-1	11		
	MP									

5 Isolating predatory incentives

ЧF 7 K Э. Р ٦F ٦ Р fi fi ъ fi AFT STAF а н \mathbf{fi} 3 K 26 τhí" ٦F \mathbf{fi} **٦** н ЪF ٦F ٦F ٦F а н fi n efi fi 7 h ٦F ٦. n fi **٦** Р ٦F ٦.fi ff 13 13 1 - 1 ъ ъ ** ^{*} ۹F \mathbf{fi} η fi υ лнан ٦F 3 F3 F Э. Р $\Pi_1 p_1; p_2 ;$ $\mathbf{f}\mathbf{f}$ 11 11 ٦F ٦F ٦F γnfi , **••** $\Pi_1^0 p_1; p_2$ $-\Pi_{1}^{0} p_{1}; p_{2}$; $\Omega_1 p_1; p_2 ; \quad -\Pi_1 p_1; p_2$; ; $@_1(p_1(e);p_2(e);e)$ fi 📭 fl $_{\mathrm{ff}}$ **٦ н** 3.F. 3.F *@p*₁ $\frac{@ \ ^{0}_{1}(p_{1}(\mathbf{e});p_{2}(\mathbf{e});\mathbf{e})}{@} >$ fi ٦F $@p_1$ $@\Omega_1 p_1$ $\underline{}^{@\Omega_1 p_1} ; p_2$; p₂ ; ; > : e^{-p_1} *@p*₁ $@_{1}(p_{1}(\mathbf{e});p_{2}(\mathbf{e});\mathbf{e})$ ۹ F ٦F ٦F $@(-p_1)$ fi n fi ٦F ٦F fi ЪF ЧF Э. н $@_1(p_1(e);p_2(e);e)$ τfi" ЭĿ $@(-p_1)$ \mathbf{fi} 7 K ٦F $\frac{\mathscr{Q}_{-1}(p_1(\mathbf{e});p_2(\mathbf{e});\mathbf{e})}{\mathscr{Q}(-p_1)}$ a f fi ٦F ٦F fi η fi 🦂 7 K ٦F 7 k ЪF S fir 0 **٦ н** ٦.F UNF ъfi . $_{\mathrm{ff}}$ 13 ٦F Э. н Ъ **٦ н** ЪÞ r-r n ۴ r fi 13 7 K ЪF 3 F 3 F ЪF 1 $\Pi_{1}^{0} p_{1}; p_{2}$ τhi" fi ; -7 K **٦** F ٦F ٦F

26

fi i fi i
$$mr_1 p_1 ; p_2$$

 $r_r , mr_1 p_1 ; p_2 \rightarrow p_1$
 \rightarrow i ff i $p_2 \rightarrow p_1$
 $Br Gr ar i$

. fi 16 - 386 - 2 าคาเคาที่ าคาคาค าค ffi **\F \F \F \F \F** U 7 F **٦**► **٦**► **٦**► аны fi ve ar " fi U . . Э. Е ٦F Ч.Н ЯÞ 3 6 3 6 3 6 ٦F

ικ ι, fl Γ



	>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>	
	>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>	
Ę	>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>	
	>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>	
04	5	
03	10	
02	D	
۲ 5		
4 4		
13 13		
ت 2		
Ē		
s	z	

6.1 Counterfactual and equilibrium correspondences

				\ F	ч.н	٦	F .	ΆF		ч н		Я.Н
7 F	;	; \overline{X}		; \overline{X}	٦ F	1 F	U	٦ F	٦ F			3 F
٦ F	ч н	ан			1 F	3.F	U			ЭР	fi	٦ F
	Ч н		ан	fi	٦ F		ан	fi 😱				



** 1F זוי גזו ⁻⁻ זו זוזו **Ч Р ٦** н ЯΕ 3 R F а н 7 K Э. Ε Я.Ε 0 Ч.Н * *3 ٦F 33 **3 6 3 63 6** 3 F 3 F ٦F **٦** н ar fi ar fi 🗤 ٦F fi **٦** F 3.6 3.6 Э. F **ч** μ ър fi ЧΕ **٦**F **٦**F fi 🗤 ዓዞ ዓሌ **Ч н ٦** F fi 🧤 **٦**F **٦**F **٦**F 31 36 чн —: Э.Н ан 3 K ٦F fi า⊧ า⊧ ~___า⊧าะ fi aran ar ጓሎ ан анан ан **ч н** ٦F ; ; \overline{X} ; \overline{X} ,... 11 11 ЧF 11 11 ЯF **٦** F **З Е** ЯF **٦** F **Ч н** Эн ٦Ε fi 📭 **٦** F Э. Ε ль fi ль ٦F **٦** F ан ff ٦F **11 16** 3 F 3F3F - 8F ЪF ff ff 1 k **Ч н ٦** н Э.Н **Ч н ٦** н Э. Ε าหาห fi าห อห ; X ЛР **٦**F **٦**F **Ч Е ٦** F **16 16** HHI^{∞} --..... **٦ н** чн чн["] чн **٦ F** ٦F ٦F **Ч н** Э. Ε а н

33

	88							
X	% %							من بور
	% %							
	% %							× =
×	% %							÷
	88							‡
	88							K.
	% %							د منور م
	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~							
	8 %							····· ···· × ×
	% %							
	% %							
		∞IHI	8_	8 S	S 8	SNPV	SNPV	·
					F		F	5

	<b>٦</b> F	<b>٦</b> F	<b>ч</b> н	<b>Ч н</b>
		3.F. 3.F	ле ае	<b>٦</b> F
	ЗΕ		<b>ЧΕ Ц</b> Ε	
<b>Т н</b>		fi 📭	ar ;	

	8	
	%	
X	%	
	%	
	%	
×	8	
	%	
	%	
	%	
	~	
	0~	
	%	
	%	
		± 7
	∞ II	
	Н	



³⁵Barry Wright Corp. v. ITT Grinnell Corp., 724 F.2d 227, 234 (1st Cir. 1983).

<b>٦ F 3 F</b>	ЛЕ	<b>٦ ⊢ ٦ ⊢ ٦ ⊢ ⊢ ⊢</b>	۰ <b>ب</b> fi
<b>1</b> F	11 16 11	<b>1</b> F <b>7</b> F	fi ar ar
<b>٦</b> F	<b>٦</b>	<b>1</b> F	ль ль _к ль
	fi 📭	<b>٦</b> ► <b>٦</b> ► <b>٦</b> ►	т ан Аан
7 h	ан ан fi ан	$CS^\infty$ $TS^\infty$	TSNPV
	fi ar arar	$CS^{NPV}$	ի՝ ԱՆԳԻ ԴԳԻՆ
	<b>1</b> F		
	fi fi 🗤	11	0.F

fi акак акак ак 3 K **36 36 36** ль ак **36 35 36 35 35** 3.6 ٦Ε **٦**Ε **٦Ε ٦Ε**ΤΕ ΤΕ 3 F 3 F ٦F **Ч н** АН АН АН 3 F 3.6 3.6 **٦** н ar ar arti ar 3.F. U - ан **16 - 16 - 16** ዓሌ ዓዞ ٦Е ar ar fi ar **٦** F **ч н** 3 F 3 F ٩F **``** 7 K **3.6 3.6** ٦F

ль льль льfiль ль ль льль fiль ль

3.6	$M$ $\sim$	n 3 n 3			ر آبار ا	U	
$L J r_{r_2} 2$	<b>٦</b> F		<b>1</b> F	<b>٦</b> म ٦ म		$A$ $n$ $\pi$	۲
		Danaa	* *		۶	<b>1</b> F	a f
n E n n	× 0	3 F		<b>٩</b> K	J 74	₩ A	۳ _*
4						E $r$	۴.
r 1 <b>2</b>			1	IF 7F	$J r_p$	$E$ $\sim$	*
ль ль ль ль а		<b>ч н</b>	E	in r	6	11	



	<b>ч</b> н	<b>٦ F - ٦ F</b>	Э. Η	Э.Н	() R I		ኘዞ		
53	fa a r	<b>٦</b> F	J	rn	In	۴.	Ε	13	7
	C	** M *	ちち ろ	r				7 F	
	₹F ₹F				ч.н	Br	*3	P	۴

 $An \pi^r L J r \pi^* \mathbf{3}$