

&+\$' \$ 5(\$'/(5  
\$FW\$QVLVWDQWH\$WVDRUQH\  
&LYLO 'LYLVLRQ  
8 6 'HSDUWPHQW RI -XVWLFH  
(7+\$1 '\$9,6  
'HSX\$WVL\$WVDRUQH\HU DO  
\*867\$9 : (</(5  
\$FWLQJHFWRU &RQVXPHU 3URWHFWLRQ %UDQFK  
.\$7+5<1 \$ 6&+0,'7  
7ULDO \$WWRUQH\ &RQVXPHU 3URWHFWLRQ %UDQFK  
3 2 %R[  
:DVKLQJWRQ '&  
3KRQH  
(PDLO .DWKU\Q \$ 6FKPLGW#XVGRM JRY

Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America

0\$77Âð Àp€ð Ð0°` @PÀ0À•0 €•`p (PDLO 0:HUQ]#IWF JRY  
(PDLO 6/HYLQH #IWF JRY

Attorneys for the Federal Trade Commission

81,7(' 67\$7(6 ',675,&7 &2857  
' ,675,&7 21)(9\$'\$

67,38/\$7,21 \$1'  
25'(5 )25 3(50\$1(17

,1-81&7,21 \$1' &,3(,1\$/7<  
-8'\*0(17  
(&) 1R

3DJH RI

3ODLQWLIQ ~~W~~ ~~K~~ ~~B~~ ~~W~~ ~~B~~ ~~I~~ ~~Q~~ ~~L~~ ~~V~~ ~~D~~ ~~H~~ ~~W~~ ~~R~~ ~~Q~~ ~~L~~ ~~F~~ ~~S~~ ~~R~~ ~~Q~~ ~~D~~ ~~R~~ ~~Q~~ ~~L~~ ~~D~~ ~~X~~ ~~F~~ ~~D~~ ~~K~~ ~~R~~ ~~L~~ ~~U~~ ~~L~~ ~~J~~ ~~D~~ ~~W~~ ~~L~~ ~~F~~ ~~R~~

\$WWR~~U~~~~Q~~~~H~~~~V~~~~D~~~~X~~~~H~~~~E~~)HGHUDO 7UDGH &RPP LIVO~~H~~~~E~~~~G~~~~Q~~~~W~~~~W~~~~R~~~~P~~~~L~~~~S~~~~V~~~~O~~~~D~~~~I~~~~R~~~~C~~

3HUPDQHQQW ,QMXQ~~F~~~~W~~~~H~~~~R~~~~Q~~~~D~~~~R~~~~Q~~~~L~~~~H~~~~O~~~~K~~~~B~~~~L~~~~D~~~~E~~~~S~~~~O~~ LQ WKLV PDWWHU

6HFWLRQV E DQ~~G~~~~H~~~~G~~~~H~~~~U~~~~D~~~~O~~~~R~~~~U~~~~D~~~~G~~~~H~~ &~~R~~~~P~~~~L~~~~S~~~~F~~~~W~~~~L~~~~R~~~~Q~~ \$~~B~~~~W~~~~6~~ &

†† E DQG D Q~~W~~~~K~~~~B~~~~O~~~~K~~~~L~~~~O~~~~C~~~~H~~~~E~~~~S~~~~W~~~~I~~~~S~~~~F~~~~W~~~~L~~~~R~~~~Q~~ 8 6 & †† F DQ

G DQG WKH &RPP~~H~~~~L~~~~Q~~~~M~~~~L~~~~R~~~~Q~~~~O~~~~V~~~~B~~~~O~~~~K~~~~W~~~~O~~~~C~~~~E~~~~S~~~~D~~~~X~~~~H~~ <sup>3</sup>&233\$ 5XOH'

& ) 5 3DUW 'HIH~~Q~~~~G~~~~D~~~~Q~~~~W~~~~V~~~~W~~~~L~~~~S~~~~X~~~~O~~~~D~~~~W~~~~H~~~~W~~~~R~~~~W~~~~K~~~~H~~~~H~~~~U~~~~P~~~~D~~~~Q~~~~H~~~~E~~~~W~~~~W~~~~Q~~~~M~~~~X~~~~Q~~~~F~~~~W~~~~S~~~~R~~~~Q~~~~D~~~~D~~~~W~~

'HIHQGDQW VWLSXODWH WR WKHH~~U~~~~P~~~~D~~~~Q~~~~H~~~~E~~~~W~~~~W~~~~Q~~~~M~~~~X~~~~Q~~~~F~~~~W~~~~S~~~~R~~~~Q~~~~D~~~~D~~~~W~~

3HQD~~O~~~~W~~~~J~~~~P~~~~H~~~~Q~~~~W~~ <sup>3</sup>2~~U~~~~G~~~~R~~~~O~~~~Y~~~~'~~~~H~~~~W~~~~R~~~~O~~~~J~~~~P~~~~D~~~~W~~~~W~~~~K~~~~L~~~~V~~~~V~~~~D~~~~I~~~~F~~~~Q~~~~V~~~~I~~~~G~~~~R~~~~Q~~~~S~~~~E~~~~H~~~~W~~~~Z~~~~H~~~~E~~~~Q~~~~W~~

7+(5())25( ,7 ,6 25'(5(' DV IROORZV

DFW)@1';G16PApp#0 @pp€ &B#@p

'LRQ BD QH€&d LVsQòQ X\

'HIHQGDQW ZDLYDW DW\PDQKLPYWKFGMV WRHXVWDE  
\$FW 8 6 & † FRQFHUQLQJ QWKKSBRJKHFKWHLBQVRH WK  
DQG DWURHEWDU LWV RZQ FRVWV DQG DWWRUQH\ IHV

'HIHQGDQW DQG DQGLQWKWZDLRVH SSKDQDRIQJRWKHU  
FRQWHVW WKH YDOLGLW\ RI WKLV 2UGHU

'( ), 1, 7, 216

)RU WKH SXUSRVKHRIIRVORZLQJGBHILW LWLRQV DSSO\

'&KLOG' PHDQV DQ LQGLYLGXDO XQGHU WKH DJH RI

'&ROOHFWV' RU 'FROOHFWLRQ' PHDQVWRWREWIDRCKHU

FKLODQPHDQV LQFOXGLQJ EXW QRW OLPLWHG WR

D 5HTXHVWLQJ SURPSWLRQLQGWREXWPLWQSHUV

LQIRUPDWLRQ RQOLQH

E (QDEDLQKLOG WR PDNH SHUVRQDEOHQIRUPDWLR

@ T LGHQWLYEHWIGEDPE @E QD SWR-OR H @QDCOD

LQIRA `ðXGLQJ EXW QRW ORW€€€ í €(P @ °



YLVLWRUV WR VXFK ZHEVLEWHRUVNREKLDQ IIRUPDWLRQ LV FRC  
PDLQWDLQHG RU RIIHUV SWRGKRWKZMEKDLWHYRUFHRVQDLQW D/CH  
VXFK ZHEVLWH RU RQOLQH VHUYLEVHLLVRSRQDYLQJGRPUHFIRP  
WKH VHYHUDO 6WDRWHVRRUH ZRWHKDEQHQDULWRSQDWRHG 6WDWHV  
LQ WKH 'LWVPEWDRIR&ZHWKWHQDQWRKHLDWREKRUHDQ\ 6W  
RU FOUQHQ QDWLRQWRULEWVRZHSGWPHSDVDKUSQRQ\@RSXIU

, Q W H U Q H W D U G W I F S O R F, S V V R U R P E G H Y I R H V H U I

---

\$ IDLOWRQJPDHNDIVRHQDFELOWMLQWDRNDGEBREXQHWVHYRORORJA\
HQVXUH WKDW DSDUHQWRI D F BIDQGVUHFHSHUDYFHWV BHWKZLWQF
FROOHFWLRQ XVHURRUGDVIEQIRVUXUHWERSHQREXFKLLQJQRWLF
PDWHULDOFKDQWLRQWKKHFRIDGLVFORVXUH SUDFWLFFHVW
FRQVHQWHG

% IDLOWRQJSRVW DQSGRFDHHDJOWDD EHLQHGQRLQINFWRRIDQW
LQIRUPDWLRQ SUDFWLFFHV ZLWK UHGILDQJGSDRHFRLUJGFUHQHQCR
ZHEVLWHRU RQOHDFKBUYIDFRIWQELQHWVHLUWHFRUZKHUHSH
LQIRUPDWLRQLV FROOHFWHG IURP FKLOGUHQ

& IDLOWRQREWDLQ QHULDLDEQVHSEDFHWLRQH XDCR RU
GLVFORVXUHRI VHEQRIQDEELQDUGHQW ERFDFQDQJHFROWKH
FROOHFWLRQ XVHWFHVGWRFQRVKSUMKHBKDVONCFRQKDHQWHG

' YLROVWHQ&JKLOGGHCQ\$3ULROFFWLRQ5XSDHUW&D
FRS\RI ZKLFKLV DWWDF\$KHG KHUHW RDV \$SSHQGL[

,, .1-81&7,21 &21&(51,1\* '/(7228+ ,/'5(116 3(5621\$ /  
,1)250\$7,21

,7,6 )857+(5 25'(5(' WKDWDQHHCQGGDQWJHQRWVHFHUV DJ
HPSOR\HHV DQG DRWKRHUQSHWVBRQWDQD SWRQHLZFLSQFBQ\RI
WKHP ZKR UHFHLYW KDFWZDGHORVUHFVSHUDEQGBQDQGHQMRLC

\$ GLVFORVLQJ XVLRQRP RFKIEGQHHCQVUJCSWURRQZKQFLQI
'HIHQGDQWREWRDHCQMG\SRILRUKLV 2UGHU DQG

% IDLOWRQJGFKWOCSSHUQTRQDO LQIRUKFDLWLSRVW KDWLBRQL
FXVWRG\ RU FRQWURDI ZHVRKLOMCPQIded, hovev WKDW VXFK



SHUVRQDO LQIRUPDWLRQ QHHG QRW EH HWGL WSRV HGDRIQW QGH  
JRYHUQPHQW DJHQFDZRUUHHXODUHLRGE\RU FRXUW RUGH

,,, 021(7\$5< -8'\*0(17 )25 &,9,/ 3(1\$/7<

,7,6)857+(25'(5(' WKDW

\$ -XGJPHQW LQ WKH +XPRKRWVRIQ)EYROODUQWHUHG

LQ IDYR3UDDLQWHIHHQDQDQVFLYLO SHQDOW\

% 'HIHQGROVHLUHVWRBOSDPOWLIQJESDWPKHQDWRUHU RI

WKH 8QLWHG 6WDWKUWZNRXKQGGHBO7ODLXFK SD\PHQW PXV

EH PDGH ZLWKIGDQVLOHQWU\ RI WKKHZUZHUH XJLHNDVHQRIRU

WKH &RPPLNORHQRURQLF IXQG WUDLQWUUSLQWDIRRORVGDSDURYZ

E\ D UHSUHVHQWBSRQHRFKSDLRHQW WKH UHPDLQGHU RI

VXVSHQGHG VXEMHFW WR WKH 6XEVHFWLRQV EHZRZ

& 7KH &RPPLVLRQ DQG 3ODLQWLII\SDUWHRIPWQW WR

MXGJPHQW LV H[SUHVVO\ SUHPLVHQQSRRQSDHWWHQHWKIROQ

IROORZLQUVZRFLO VWDWHPHQWVODHQLYHHODWHHGQDRFXDQ

UHSUHVHQWDGLWQWKVX&RPLVLRQ QDPHO\

WKH )LQDQFLDO HGDQVPHBQWPHI 6E\PHLV QF VL

6KDIULU 3UHVPEHQW RQ 6HLSVFXGQQVWQDQW

WKH )LQDQFLDOHQHGDQVPHBQWPHI RQ 6HSWHPEI

DQG VXEPLWWHG WR&RPLQVFXGRQDQVQDWW

' 7KH VXVSHQVLRQWRZLQDHEMIXGLIWHQV&RPLVLRQLRQL

RU 3ODLQWLII WKHH&RQGDQWQVHWHQVDDQVPHV WR GLVFOI

---

---

---

GHVFLQ L GHWDLORWK B HPG DRV \$DUHQWV WR UHYL  
LQIRUPDWLRQ FROOHFWHG IURP WKHLU FKLOGUHQ DQG WR  
DQG

SURYLGHRIDHFRFSK ENGRZOS HGJPHQW RFWDLKIHG S  
2UGHU XQOHVXESULHWLR&WOR WKH &RPPLVVLRQ

% )RU \HDUV DIIWHKULVHQVGHU 'HIHQFRQVORXQWHVXE  
QRWLFH VZRUQ XQGHU SHQDOW\FRDQJHUMXQ\GZLWLKIDWHG  
SRLQW RI FRQWDFWURUFWXUH IRQWLWHQDQVQWHQJGDQW KDV D  
LQWHUHVW LQRUFLQGWURDWDGEMFSDOORFH REOLJDWLRQV  
WKLW 2UGHU WQFRQGLQJHEUVDROHWKRHEDQWLRDQXVGLLQJ\

SDURQWLOLDWH WKDW HQJJDJHVFLQWR\WKFLW2BGHSUDFWLFH  
& 'HIHQGDQW PXVW VXEPLW WR WKRI&DQPEVQINRQXQRN  
SHWLWLRQ LQVROYHLQEDURSFURFHQGLQJUEFRUHDHQGDQW Z  
GD\LVWM ILOLQJ

' \$QVXEPLVVLRQ WRQVWHT&XLRPHVZULG\ZURUQRXEQGHU  
SHQDOWSHQPMXWHEHDQIG DFFXUDZLW\KQ6&FR\PSO\ VXFK DV E\  
FRQFOXGLQJXQGHQDURH SHUMXURW\BQGMUHGVKMDVRI\$P  
WKDW WKH IRDQGRELUULFWUX(HHQXGWXGSBQ\LBMBBYGDWH

D% RQ UHT \



) D FRS\ RI HDFK XPLQWH DQ K HUPADUNHBOHLDUNHWLQJ  
VFULSW RU RWKIDG HUSURFRQHWLIRQQZLWK SURPRWLQJ RU  
JRRG RU VHUYLFH

9,0,Üí@\_\_\_\_\_





MATTHEW H. WERNZ

Chicago, IL 60604  
Tel: (312) 950-3034

POD DEPENDANT

11/29/18

*Matthew Wernz*

Stacey M. Grandtina  
ZwillGen, PLLC

Washington, DC 20036  
Tel: (202) 706-9213

13  
14

*Stacey M. Grandtina*

12/22/18

Step & Brevley, LLP  
1400 M Street, NW, Suite 2000

15

Attorneys for Defendant Prime Sites, Inc.

20

21

*Stacey M. Grandtina*

Date:

1-20-18

by Amir Shafiq, President

22

25

26

27

28

