

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES**

**09 11 2018
592134**

In the Matter of

**Tronox Limited
a corporation,**

**National Industrialization Company
(TASNEE)
a corporation,**

**National Titanium Dioxide Company
Limited (Cristal)
a corporation,**

And

**Cristal USA Inc.
a corporation.**

ORIGINAL

Docket No. 9377

JOINT SUBMISSION TO THE COURT

On Thursday, September 6, 2018, this Court requested supplemental briefing to address “the effect of the district court’s opinion and order on any factual or legal issue in this case, including the preclusive effect, if any, of the district court’s factual findings, legal conclusions, or judgment.” *See* Dkt. 9377, Order Requiring Supplemental Post-Trial Briefs (Sept. 6, 2018). In response, the parties jointly submit the following:

1. Judge Trevor N. McFadden held a hearing on Complaint Counsel’s motion for a preliminary injunction on August 7-9, 2018. The District Court allowed each side to present live testimony from three witnesses of their choosing and the parties submitted briefs outlining their positions and the complete administrative record. The District Court entered an order granting Complaint Counsel’s Motion on September 5, 2018. *See Federal Trade Commission v. Tronox Limited, et al.*, 1:18-cv-01622 (TNM), Dkt. 105.
2. The federal district court’s decision was decided on the preliminary injunction standard expressed in 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), and this merits action was brought pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 45(b). The decision and findings of the federal district court have no preclusive effect on this Court’s decision concerning the legality of the proposed transaction. *See ProMedica Health Sys., Inc.*, 152 F.T.C. 708, 711 (2011). This Court may consider the district-court decision persuasive authority to the extent it deems appropriate.

With the parties having jointly submitted this response, the parties waive any right to file reply briefs and respectfully ask the Court to consider the briefing on this matter closed for purposes of Rules 3.46 and 3.51 of the Federal Trade Commission’s Part 3 Rules. The parties respectfully ask the Court to reschedule closing arguments expeditiously.

Dated: September 11, 2018

Submitted By:

/s/ Michael F. Williams, P.C.

Michael F. Williams, P.C.

Karen McCartan DeSantis

KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

655 Fifteenth Street, N.W.

Suite 1200

Washington, D.C. 20005

(202) 879-5000

(202) 879-5200 (facsimile)

michael.williams@kirkland.com

karen.desantis@kirkland.com

ATTORNEYS FOR TRONOX LIMITED

/s/ James L. Cooper

James L. Cooper
Peter J. Levitas
Ryan Z. Watts
Katherine E. Clemons
ARNOLD & PORTER KAYE SCHOLER LLP
601 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, D.C. 20001-3743
(202) 942-5000
(202) 942-5999 (facsimile)
james.cooper@arnoldporter.com
peter.levitas@arnoldporter.com
ryan.watts@arnoldporter.com
katherine.clemons@arnoldporter.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR NATIONAL
INDUSTRIALIZATION COMPANY
(TASNEE), THE NATIONAL TITANIUM
DIOXIDE COMPANY LIMITED (CRISTAL),
AND CRISTAL USA INC.**

/s/ Dominic Vote

Dominic Vote
Deputy Assistant Director
Federal Trade Commission
Bureau of Competition
400 7th Street SW
Washington, D.C. 20024
Phone: (202) 326-3505
Email: dvote@ftc.gov

COUNSEL SUPPORTING COMPLAINT

CERTIFICATE FOR ELECTRONIC FILING

I certify that the electronic copy sent to the Secretary of the Commission is a true and correct copy of the paper original and that I possess a paper original of the signed document that is available for review by the parties and the adjudicator.

September 11, 2018

By: /s/ Michael F. Williams
Michael F. Williams

Notice of Electronic Service

I hereby certify that on September 11, 2018, I filed an electronic copy of the foregoing Joint Submission to the Court, with:

D. Michael Chappell
Chief Administrative Law Judge
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Suite 110
Washington, DC, 20580

Donald Clark
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Suite 172
Washington, DC, 20580

I hereby certify that on September 11, 2018, I served via E-Service an electronic copy of the foregoing Joint Submission to D. Michael Chappell

Michael Becker
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
mbecker@kirkland.com
Respondent

Karen McCartan DeSantis
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
kdesantis@kirkland.com
Respondent

Megan Wold
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
megan.wold@kirkland.com
Respondent

Michael DeRita
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
michael.derita@kirkland.com
Respondent

Charles Loughlin
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
cloughlin@ftc.gov
Complaint

Cem Akleman
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
cakleman@ftc.gov
Complaint

Thomas Brock
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
TBrock@ftc.gov
Complaint

Krishna Cerilli
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
kcerilli@ftc.gov
Complaint

Steven Dahm
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
sdahm@ftc.gov
Complaint

E. Eric Elmore
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
eelmore@ftc.gov
Complaint

Sean Hughto
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission

shughto@ftc.gov
Complaint

Joonsuk Lee
Attorney
@aRocj T* teKfC C Mission

Federal Trade Commission
cwaldeck@ftc.gov
Complaint

Katherine Clemons
Associate
Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP
katherine.clemons@arnoldporter.com
Respondent

Eric D. Edmondson
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
eedmondson@ftc.gov
Complaint

David Morris
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
DMORRIS1@ftc.gov
Complaint

Zachary Avallone
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
zachary.avallone@kirkland.com
Respondent

Rohan Pai
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
rpai@ftc.gov
Complaint

Rachel Hansen
Associate
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
rachel.hansen@kirkland.com
Respondent

Peggy D. Bayer Femenella
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
pbayer@ftc.gov
Complaint

Grace Brier
Kirkland & Ellis LLP
grace.brier@kirkland.com
Respondent

Alicia Burns-Wright
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission
aburnswright@ftc.gov
Complaint

Janet Kim
Attorney
Federal Trade Commission

jkim3@ftc.gov
Complaint

Andrew Pruitt
Attorney