

PUBLIC  
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION  
RECEIVED

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

67-77-2070  
599011

In the Matter of

JUDICIAL  
STATION

Apple Group, Inc.

a corporation,

Docket No. 92

And

JUUL Labs, Inc.

a corporation

ANSWER AND DEFENSE

TO THE COMPLAINT

Apple Group, Inc. ("Apple") and JUUL Labs, Inc. ("JUUL") hereby answer and defend against the Complaint filed by the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC") on [Date]. Apple and JUUL deny the allegations in the Complaint and request that the Commission dismiss the Complaint with prejudice. Apple and JUUL request that the Commission award them their costs and attorney's fees. To the extent such a response is required, Apple and JUUL request that the Commission find that the allegations in the Complaint are false and misleading and that Apple and JUUL are entitled to summary judgment. Apple and JUUL request that the Commission find that the allegations in the Complaint are false and misleading and that Apple and JUUL are entitled to summary judgment. Apple and JUUL request that the Commission find that the allegations in the Complaint are false and misleading and that Apple and JUUL are entitled to summary judgment.



38% / ,

EHIRUH WKH SDG WLLCHWRHYE Q D JHWHHPWHQW \$ O, QUD G GLUWRL  
 KDG D VPDOO PDUNHW SRVLWLRQY Z HGJHF QVLCRI Q FVDRNL  
 DOVR RWKHU VLJQLRIGKDFQW RQY MSKRUPDUNHW WKDW I  
 7KH &RPPLVVLRQ¶V FDVH IDLOV EHFVXWHUVRIGWKF  
 7KH UHOLHI VRXJQW VQRXKIOG &WRPISODIRUH EH GHQLH  
\$16:(56 72 ,1',9,'8\$/ 3\$5\$\*5\$3+6

(DFK SDUDJUDSK EHOVZHFVUDPHHVQRREHOJWKGIS&URI  
 -/, GHQLHV WKHHIRUJYDUVDHQQVSIQ H YD,SRGPPSW

À pAWK@0

-, ODFNV NQRZOW B JDIGPXLMLRUHQWQ Q V B H DDJ  
UHJDUGLQJ \$OWULDQDWKHPDDONHJWH G KDHOHHYDQW PDU  
DOOHJDWLRQV LQ 3DUDJUDSK

-, GHQLHV WKQ BDDHJDDSLKRQVH L F H S V QWR \$ D  
UHDFKHG D VHW RI DJUHHPHQWV RQ 'HFHPEHU

-, DGPLWV WKHKHOIQHJVDWVLRQWHRQFWH, FGIHQDW  
UHPDLQLQJ DOOHJDWLRQV RI 3DUWJHDS B D VD/QG U&R  
3XUFKDVH \$JUHPHQW E\ DQG DPRQJ -XXO /DEV ,Q  
//& GDWHG DV RI 'HFHPEHU WKKH 5 BXUDFWKIDRQH

E\ DQG DPRQJ -XXQ D D \*URXS, QF, QF \$OWHUS \$OWHUL D / Q G  
'HFHPEHU WKH 35HODWLRQV \$LISH \$JUHHPHQW WE

\$OWULD \*URXS , QF, QD QG D XWOG / D E V R I ' H W K R E H H U Y L I  
\$JUHPHQW' WKR SQW WO OIHFHQQV D Q \$ E U M Z P H H Q W \$ C E W U

LWV 6XEVLGLDULHV DQG -XXO /DEV , QF HQWHUHC  
3URSHUW\ /LFHQV QG \$ J U H H P H Q W W K \$ P H Q G R O V I D Q G \$ 5 H V

DQG DPRQJ -XXO / D E R X S Q F, Q F \$ O W W I L D ( Q W H U S U L V I  
&RPPRQ +ROGHUV DQG HDFK \$GGLWLRQDO WDUHW 39 R

\$JUHPHQW' IRU D PRUH FRPSOHW H F R Q G H D F V X U D V

-, ODFNV NQRZOW B JDIGPXLMLRUHQWQ Q V B H DDJ  
FRQFHUQLQJ \$OWULHQLHV RWKKHDDDDHSDKWL B Q G L C R W I

&RPSODLQW WDNHV WKH TXRWHG SDWVIDJHV R X W R I K F  
TXRWH VKRZV W Q D W R B \$ Q D V L D H V S U H Q L G L Q J P R Q H \ R Q  
UHODWH WR H YDSRU SURGXFWV

-/, GHQLHV WKH DOOHJDWLRQV LQ 3DUDJUD

-/, DGPLWVDWKRQDODHJDUDJUDSK

-/, GHQLHV WKDQDQHDGKDFRPHSHWIKWUYHIRH

WKH DOOHJDWLRQV RI WKH ILUVMHVHVKHQRHHRJD3DU

VHQWHQFH RI 3DUDJUDSK H[FHSHQWRURDQDULWKL

DQG RU FDSLWDO DQG WKDW QHZ DWRKDFUR]SWRQFE

SXUVXDQW WR VWDWXWRU\ DQG UHZI XORDRFRURUSHTRG

PDUNHWHG DQG VROGWHQWKH\$QVSHFWGXOO\ UHIHU

UHJXODWRU\ UHTXLUHPHQWV IRU DQRURI FARKPSLOHWR

-/, GHQLHV WKH 3DUDJUDASLKRQVHL[WHLSWHQRVE

FHUWDLQ DPHQGPHQWVQZDWK\$OWHDXSBRBWHVKDF

SURYLGLQJ WR -/, WEKHUFDXLSVRDMLQHLQROXGLQJZLWK



LQFRQVLVWHQW KZLSV \$ JW KHP5HCOVD WQ B G V D W H R Q W Z F L K // H  
NQRZOHGJH VXIILF QH QWK W B O G P J D W B R J Q G / H L Q 3 D U D J L

- / , U H V S H F W I X O O N W Y H I F H W \$ W R H W K P H Q S V \$ D Q B H  
D P R U H F R P S O H W D W D H P G I D W F R X I U D W W K H U M F R Q W Q W K D W 7  
3 D U D J U D S K D U H K L W K R G V H L W W L F R W \$ J L W H P H Q W D Q G  
G H Q L H V V X F K D O O H J D W L R Q V

- / , U H V S H F W I X O Q W W H I O I H U F W W X B O W X U H R S P H U Q W / I L  
F R P S O H W H D Q G D F F X U D W H V W D W H P K D Q W W R K H L W O F H R J C  
D U H L Q F R Q V L V O H Q W O Z A P W K A V K H ` , Q W O O @ 3 U R S H U W

-/, DGPLWV WKDW LW LQWURGXFHGW88L/Q LWWK  
V -/, RWKHUZLGHHDXNLFNLGRZOWR DGPLW RU GI

LQFOXGLQJ DOOHJDWLRQV FRQFHDQIDQJW\$OWULD

-, ODFNV NQRZOWBJDGPXMLRUHQWQ\ WKK RV

-, ODFNV NQRZOWBJDGPXMLRUHQWQV\$DHDJ  
EXW QRWHV WKDWWKRZDRUGPHUOQ(DURGI \$OWULD

-, WKHQ RSHUDWLRUJ3\$GEBVWKEFQDDEPLW  
SRG EDVHG H YDSRU SURGXFWWK88/ DLQPLWV WKDW  
VHSDUDWH FRPSDQLHDELQ ,QF ZOG BDEMDP,QE -X-X,OR  
GHQLHV WKHDLQBDLUDSK

-, UHVSHFWIXO\ADUWKIWHV WRHJXKHQWLRQKHU  
JRYHUQLQJ WKH )'\$TV SUHPDUNHW DXWKRULJDWLRQ  
VWDWHPHQW RI WKZR UNJXDFWKRH\HJMDHQW WKDW WK  
LQFRQVLVWHQW ZLWK WKDW UHJXOHWRULRQJDBDGRD  
307\$ ILOLQJ GDWRKDWQEGHQRD6HSWHPEHU

-, DGPLWV WKDW SUHSDULQJ D 30R\$ WHHTRX  
WLPH SHUVRQQHO DQG PRQH\²DQG QRWHV WKDW V  
FRPSDQLHV LQ SUHSDULQJ 307\$V DQGRD\$VBBRYWQ  
VPDOO FRPSDQLHGHQLHRWKKHJZLQDHSJWLRQV RI 3D

-, UHVSHFWIXOO\ UHIHUV WR WKHQW\$TVQ-EG  
UHIHUHQFHG VWDWKHWHI\$DWRFBUEHFERPSDQHWVWDQGH





3DUDJUDSK VFRVFRXWLRQVDFRZKLFK QR  
H[WHQW WKDWTDLUHGSRQVDFEWNHQRZOHGJH VXIILF  
LQ 3DUDJUDSK

-, GHQLHV WKH DOOHJDWLRQV LQ 3DUDJUD

3DUDJUDSK SURQJLGRGDLQERPSHODGWKHGDM

\*XLGHOLQHV \$PRVWRWKUJHWKXQGVHOLQHV GR QRW



HYLGHQFH RI LWVFSRQFWHQ\ UH,IHUV WR WKH TXR'  
DFFXUDWH VWDWHPHQW RI WKHLU FRQWHQWV

-/, GHQLHV WKH DOOHJDDSLRQV HL[W HLSW HWIRFE  
DQQRXQFHG WKH 3XUFKDVH \$JUHHPHQW DQG RWKHU  
UHVSHFWIXOO\ UHIHUV WR WKRVH DEJXHUPWQ WWW DRU  
FRQWHQWV

-/, GHQLHV WKH ILUVW WZR VHQWHQFHV RI  
3XUFKDVH \$JUHHPHQW DQG RWKHU PDSOHLVQ DOOHJDDSLRQV  
RI WKHLU FRQWHQWV HLOHLO FORIGWUHQSHUPHQW RZV R KSS:  
IURP <sup>3</sup>WDN>LQJQHDSFXULSRQH ZLIWSUWSDULQJ WR HQJD  
LQFOXGLQJ WKURXSIRQVQJLQJUHLOSHUPHQW DQVIGYLYWL  
WKH UHPDLQLQJDOOHJDDSLRQV RZV R KSS: DOOHJDDSLRQV  
RXW RI FRQWHQW DQG PLVFKDUDFWHULJHV LW DQG  
SRLQWV IRU D PRFXUDSLRQVHQWVHQWV RYKWHFRQWV  
VKRZV WKDW LW ZDV UHIHUULQJ WRE DOOHJDDSLRQV  
WR HYDSRU SURGXFWV

-/, GHQLHV WKH DOOHJDDSLRQV LQ 3DUDJUD

-/, GHQLHV WKH ILUVW VHQWHQFHVHQWVHQWV RYKWHFRQWV  
VXIILFLHQW WR DOOHJDDSLRQV\ LQK3DUDJUDSK

-/, ODFNV NQRZOWR JDIGVXMLRUHQWQV RYKWHFRQWV  
FRQFHUQLQJ \$OWKDW LW/PDGLPWWVWVKH SULFHV RI  
DOOHJDDSLRQV LQ HQWVHQWV RYKWHFRQWV RYKWHFRQWV RYKWHFRQWV

38% / ,

LPSDFWHG -/,¶V H YDSRU SURGXFW

SURGXFWV WKDW KDYH UHFHLYHGQ33H\$ V/S\$QBY DOK E  
HOHFWURQLF GHYUEN I, QVFI BQKDDWSKOFD U V W R E D F F R  
SDSHU WR JHQHUDWH D QLFRWLQHD S S Q W D D Q L L Q D H  
WR WKH H[WHQW WKDW SRUWLRQ V H O R I R A K N X E P O M V D R  
WKH )7& 6WDII GLXJDLVQLRQWR/ I LVQYHUWVWDSQVDFW W O R Q U H I I  
GRFXPHQWV DQG VXEPLVVLRQV IRUH D H P R W H R I F W K S Q U  
RWKHUZLVH GHQLHV WKH DOOHJDWLRQV LQ 3DUDJU

-/, GHQLHV WKH D D D D H J D D S I K R Q V D Q G U V H V S H F X

PDGH E\ -/, WR WKH Q Y 7 H V G K J L V Q U R L Q R Q L W R K U H D 7 P B Q M D F I  
DFFXUDWH VWDWHPHQW RI WKH U H T G X L E M P H Q W V I R L

-/, GHQLHV WKH DOOHJDWLRQV LQ 3DUDJUD

-/, ODFNV NQRZOHFGQ H V X I U L E Q H R Q W P D W R L I R U P D

WKH DOOHJDWLRQV G R G H D L H D W U D S K P R Q W K D W E S ð X 0,

° -/, GHQLHV WKH DOOHJDWLRQV LQ

Ê -/, G H , Q L H V Y D W K H D W Q N J Q W L R Q W L R Q

-/, GHQLHV WKH DOOHJDWL

\$)),50\$7,9( \$1' 27+(5 ')(16(6

-/, DVVHUWV WKHHR ØDVR ZLQHVSHHVDVWRL RVK HD FOD  
&RPSODLQW ZLWKRXVNGEIQVXIPBQR RKKHHSVHXVFK IEXLURG  
&RPPLVLRQ -/, JUKHW MURY M X SWS ØHI ØVQVL VFRY B H I HSQMF

),567 ')(16(

7KH &RPSODLQW IDLOV WR VWDWH DDQ FODLP XSR

6(&21' ')(16(

&RXQW , RI WKH &RPSODLQWIDFMOV VXIILFLHQW  
5HVSRRGHQWV DJUHHG ZLWK RQH ØRMDØHIU WKDWV  
SURGXFWV DW DQ\GWURØJ DDQFOSXGXLWRQ JSWKRIU7WBQV  
DQG WKHUHIRUH GRHV QRW VWDWH D FODLP XQGHU  
\$FW

7+,5' ')(16(

&RXQW ,, IDLOVP DRDLVQVWH-D XQBHU 6HFWLRQ  
86 & † EHFDXVH WKDW VHFVLRQ DSSOLHV RC

)2857+ ')(16(

7R WKH H[WHQVQGVK,DRM &RXHQ &R/P,SULDLPQVGLVHFORQR  
H YDSRU SURGXFWVQLVDELOHLN IQHFVU BRHFDQWODWBIEKH  
DQG &RXQWV , HDQGLQ WRHUVHDRVH D FODLP

),)7+ ')(16(

7KH &RPSODLQW IDLOV WR DOOHJH DQ\ KDUP WI

6,;7+ ')(16(

7KH &RPSODLQW IDLOV WR DOOHJH DQ\ KDUP WI





7+,57((17+ ')(16(

7KH &RPPLVLRQ¶VDWR-FHIGXUHIJKWLVHUSURFRFHVHG  
'XH 3URFHVV &ODXVH RI WKH )LIWK \$PHQGPHQW

)2857((17+ ')(16(

7KH &RPPLVLRQ¶VUSDWRDHGXUEHNVHEDUDEVLWVHRSDURF  
WKDQ WR SURFHHLGLQJV EHIRUH DQ¶SUWILFKWHWRMKT  
XQGHU WKH )LIWK \$PHQGPHQW

),)7((17+ ')(16(

\$OWULD¶VGLVEWQWHLQDSDWRURSURGXFWVGLGQR  
VXEVWDQWLDOORQWRVWQHFRPSHWLKR VH SURGXF  
DSSURYDO

6,;7((17+ ')(16(

\$OWULD¶VGLRGRQWHLQKHGHYHORSXFWWRBILGHZRI  
XQUHDVRQDEO\UHVWUDLQWUDGHJLRYHQXVEMD'SWLD  
IUDPHZRUN

6(9(17((17+ ')(16(

\$OWULD¶VGLRGRQWHLQXDDLQH YDSIDVRSURGXFW  
VXEVWDQWLDOO\BHWKHHHIFRPSWVQWVXFKVBLQBSQU  
VFLHQWLILFRUHSSHEWVEVHHDDWG E\WKH )'\$

(,\*+7((17+ ')(16(

&RXQWV , DQG , , IDLO WR VWDWWVDLQDWRHEBIF6  
FLJDUHWWHV'VHKGI&RPI\$QDQMFEDWJHUERWWKIFORRH



&(57.)&\$7( 2)  
6(59.&(

, +(5(%< &(57,)< WKDW RQ , -XDXVHGUDJ HFWUX HF RDS  
IRU HJRLQJ \$QVZHR DQGH 'HRFQOBVQW KWR KEH) HGHUG  
&RPPLVVLRQ TV ( )LOLQJ SODWIRUR VZKLFK KLZILQQ WH

2IILFH RI WKH 6HFUHWDU\  
)HGHUDO 7UDGH &RPPLVVLRQ  
&RQVWLWXWLRQ &HQWHU  
6HYHQWK 6WUHHW 6: 6XLWH  
:DVKLQJWRQ '&

7KH +RQRUDEOH ' 0LFKDHO &KDSSHOO  
&KLHI \$GPLQLVWUDWLYH /DZ -XGJH  
)HGHUDO 7UDGH &RPPLVVLRQ  
3HQQV\OYDQLD \$YH 1: 5P +  
:DVKLQJWRQ '&

, +(5(%< &(57,)< WKDW RQ - , GHOLRQUHGDYLO  
FRUHFV FRS\ RI WKH DQGHUHQJH \$QVZHR &RPSC

-DPHV \$EHOO MDEHOO#IWF JRY  
'RPLQLF 9RWH GYRWH#IWF JRY  
3HJJ\ %D\HU )HPHQHOOD SED\HU#IWF JRY  
(ULN +HUURQ HKHUURQ#IWF JRY  
-RRQVXN /HH MOHH #IWF JRY  
0HUHGLWK /HYHUW POHYHUW#IWF JRY  
.ULVWLDQ 5RJHUV NURJHUV#IWF JRY  
'DYLQ 0RUULV GPRUULV #IWF JRY  
0LFKDHO %OHYLQV PEOHYLQV#IWF JRY  
0LFKDHO /RYLQJHU PORYLQJHU#IWF JRY  
)UDQFHV \$QQH -RKQVRQ IMRKQVRQ#IWF JRY  
6LPRQH 2EHUVFKPLHG VREHUVFKPLHG#IWF JRY  
-XOLD 'UDSHU MGUDSHU#IWF JRY  
)HGHUDO 7UDGH &RPPLVVLRQ  
3HQQV\OYDQLD \$YHQXH 1:  
:DVKLQJWRQ '&  
3KRQH 1XPEHU  
)D[ 1XPEHU

Complaint Counsel

0DUF :ROLQVN\ 0:ROLQVN\#ZOUN FRP  
-RQDWKDQ 0 0RVHV -00RVHV#ZOUN FRP  
.HYLQ 6 6FKZDUW] .6FKZDUW]#ZOUN FRP

:DFKWHOO /LSWRQ 5RVHQ .DW]  
:HVW QG 6WUHHW  
1HZ <RUN 1<  
3KRQH 1XPEHU  
)D[ 1XPEHU

Counsel for Respondent Altria Group, Inc.

0LFKDHO / 6LEDULXP PLFKDHO VLEDULXP#SLOC  
5REHUW & . %R\G UREHUW ER\G#SLOOVEXU\O[  
'DYL G & \*URVVPDQ GDYL G JURVVPDQ#SLOOVEX  
3LOOVEXU\ :LQWKURS 6KDZ 3LWVDPDQ //3  
6HYHQWHHQWK 6WUHHW 1:  
:DVKLQJWRQ '&  
3KRQH 1XPEHU  
)D[ 1XPEHU

Counsel for Respondent Juul Labs, Inc.

/s/ David I. Gelfand

'DYL G , \*HOIDQG  
-HUHP\ &DOV\Q  
&/(\$5< \*277/, (% 67((1  
+\$0,/721 //3  
3HQQV\OYDQLD \$YH  
:DVKLQJWRQ '&  
7  
)

Counsel for Respondent Juul Labs, Inc.

Notice of Electronic Service

I hereby certify that on July 27, 2020, I filed an electronic copy of the foregoing Answer and Defenses of Respondent Juul Labs, Inc., with:

D. Michael Chappell  
Chief Administrative Law Judge  
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Suite 110  
Washington, DC, 20580

Donald Clark  
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Suite 172  
Washington, DC, 20580

I hereby certify that on July 27, 2020, I served via E-Service an electronic copy of the foregoing Answer and Defenses of Respondent Juul Labs, Inc., upon:

David Gelfand  
Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP  
dgelfand@cgsh.com  
Respondent

Jeremy Calsyn  
Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP  
jcalsyn@cgsh.com  
Respondent

Jessica Hollis  
Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP  
jhollis@cgsh.com  
Respondent

Matthew Bachrack  
Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP  
mbachrack@cgsh.com  
Respondent

James Abell  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
jabell@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Dominic Vote  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
dvote@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Peggy Bayer Femenella  
Attorney  
Federal Trade Commission  
pbayer@ftc.gov  
Complaint

Erik Herron  
Attorney



justin.hedge@arnoldporter.com  
Respondent

Francesca Pisano  
Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP  
francesca.pisano@arnoldporter.com  
Respondent

Le-Tanya Freeman  
Arnold & Porter Kaye Scholer LLP  
tanya.freeman@arnoldporter.com  
Respondent

Marc Wolinsky  
Wachtell, Lipton, Rosen & Katz  
mwolinsky@wlrk.com  
Respondent

Jonathan Moses  
Partner  
Wachtell, Lipton, Rosen & Katz  
jmmoses@wlrk.com  
Respondent

Kevin Schwartz  
Wachtell, Lipton, Rosen & Katz  
kschwartz@wlrk.com  
Respondent

Adam Goodman  
Wachtell, Lipton, Rosen & Katz  
ALGoodman@wlrk.com  
Respondent

Michael L. Sibarium  
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP  
michael.sibarium@pillsburylaw.com  
Respondent

Robert C. K. Boyd  
Attorney  
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP  
robert.boyd@pillsburylaw.com  
Respondent

David C. Grossman  
Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP  
david.grossman@pillsburylaw.com  
Respondent

David Gelfand  
Attorney