

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA Federal Trade Commission

WASHINGTON, D.C. 20580

Dissenting Statement of Commissioner Andrew N. Ferguson Regarding the FY2023 HSR Annual Report to Congress Commission File No. P859910

October 10, 2024

I share Commissioner Holyoak's view that we need clear criteria about which transactions should go in the report and how to classify them to avoid potential gamesmanship and confusion. This problem dates back many years, and has gone unaddressed in Commissions controlled by both parties. We are overdue for a correction.

The lack of clear criteria—and the resulting risk of confusion—is illustrated by the Commission's and Antitrust Division's divergent approaches towards presenting litigation results. The Commission notes in a table that it filed and litigated four complaints in Fiscal Year 2023.² The table lists the outcomes of those four complaints in rows below: one victory, two pre-decision settlements, and one still in litigation.³ In a footnote, the Commission also describes the 2023 outcome of a complaint filed in a prior year.⁴ In its corresponding table, the Antitrust Division takes a different approach. Like the Commission, it notes the number of complaints filed in 2023.⁵ But, for the totals of each outcome, it includes complaints filed in prior years that resulted in an outcome in 2023.⁶ Although the tables look very similar, the two agencies are using different methodologies to generate them. The methodological discrepancy makes it difficult to compare the agencies' respective reports, and diminishes the value of the report. The discrepancy also likely would go unnoticed by all but the most careful reader. The agencies should agree on a single methodology for the report and clearly explain the methodological choice to Congress.

Were this report due to Congress imminently, I would alert Congress to the methodological faults it contains and concur in its issuance. These problems—again, most of which have featured in every report for years—are insufficient to justify breaching our statutory duty to submit this report to Congress. But the report is not due imminently. The law requires us to issue this report "annually," and not necessarily at the conclusion of the fiscal year. We issued the most recent report on December 21, 2023. The Commission under Chair Khan has not submitted this report to

¹ See Dissenting Statement of Melissa Holyoak, Comm'r, Fed. Trade Comm'n, Regarding the FY2023 HSR Annual Report to Congress, FTC Matter No. P859910 (Oct. 10, 2024).

² Fed. Trade Comm'n & U.S. Dept. of Just., Hart-Scott-Rodino Annual Report, Fiscal Year 2023, at 3 (Oct. 10, 2024). ³ *Ibid.*

⁴ *Id.* at 3, n. 5.

⁵ *Id.* at 5, n.

ia. at

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Consolidated Appropriations Act, Pub. L. No. 117-328, § 102, 236 Stat. 4459, 5968 (2022).

Congress earlier than Novembreport, therefore, is the first so	per 8, and once did no uch report the Comm	t issue it until Februa ission will have subr	ary of the next year.8 The nitted to Congress before	This fore